

# TENDRING DISTRICT COUNCIL

Planning Services Council Offices, Thorpe Road, Weeley, Clacton-on-Sea, Essex CO16 9AJ

AGENT: Guy French - Foxes Rural Consultants Limited Foxes House Foxes Lane Eight Ash Green Colchester CO6 3PS APPLICANT: Mr and Mrs Ian Warder C/o Agent

## TOWN AND COUNTRY PLANNING ACT 1990

APPLICATION NO: 20/00120/FUL DATE REGISTERED: 25th February 2020

Proposed Development and Location of Land:

## Proposed retention of mobile home for occupation as an annexe. 83 Hungerdown Lane Lawford Manningtree Essex

THE TENDRING DISTRICT COUNCIL AS LOCAL PLANNING AUTHORITY <u>HEREBY</u> <u>REFUSE PLANNING PERMISSION</u> in accordance with the application form, supporting documents and plans submitted for the following reason(s)

1 Although described as an annexe, this proposal constitutes a self-contained dwelling. The mobile home has its own kitchen, three bedrooms, one bathroom, one en-suite as well as a large living/dining area. The mobile home would be accessible by car via the existing driveway which is also shared with 84 Hungerdown Lane. The mobile home has a large footprint in relation to that of 83 Hungerdown Lane and by virtue of the amount and nature of accommodation provided is considered to be a separate unit of residential accommodation which has no reliance upon facilities within the host dwelling. The proposal must therefore be considered as a new dwellinghouse outside of the settlement limits. An annexe is a term that refers to a considerably greater degree of dependence on the donor property. Very little would have to change for the property to be fully severed from the donor property. It would not therefore be possible to condition that the 'annexe' remains ancillary to the donor property when it is currently not ancillary. The proposal must therefore be considered as being for a new dwelling in the countryside and assessed in accordance with local and national policies that relate to such developments.

The application site falls outside of any Settlement Development Boundary, as defined in both the Adopted Tendring Local Plan 2007 and the Emerging Tendring District Local Plan 2013-2033 and Beyond Publication Draft. Adopted Tendring District Local Plan 2007, Policy QL1 sets out that development should be focussed towards the larger urban areas and to within development boundaries as defined within the Local Plan. These sentiments are carried forward in emerging Policy SPL1 of the Publication Draft.

The National Planning Policy Framework 2019 (NPPF) requires Councils to boost significantly the supply of housing to meet objectively assessed future housing needs in full. In any one year, Councils must be able to identify five years' worth of deliverable housing land against their projected housing requirements (plus an appropriate buffer to

ensure choice and competition in the market for land, account for any fluctuations in the market or to improve the prospect of achieving the planned supply). If this is not possible, or housing delivery over the previous three years has been substantially below (less than 75%) the housing requirement, paragraph 11 d) of the NPPF requires applications for housing development needing to be assessed on their merits, whether sites are allocated for development in the Local Plan or not.

At the time of this decision, the supply of deliverable housing sites that the Council can demonstrate falls below 5 years and so the NPPF says that planning permission should be granted for development unless the adverse impacts of doing so would significantly and demonstrably outweigh the benefits, when assessed against the policies in the National Planning Policy Framework as a whole. Determining planning applications therefore entails weighing up the various material considerations. The housing land supply shortfall is relatively modest when calculated using the standard method prescribed by the NPPF. In addition, the actual need for housing was found to be much less than the figure produced by the standard method when tested at the recent Examination in Public of the Local plan. Therefore, the justification for reducing the weight attributed to Local Plan policies is reduced as is the weight to be given to the delivery of new housing to help with the deficit.

Whilst it is recognised that there would be conflict with Saved Policy QL1 and Emerging Policy SPL1 in terms of the site being sited outside the settlement development boundary, as stated above, in the context of the 5 year housing land supply paragraph 11 d) of the NPPF requires applications for housing development to be assessed on their merits, whether sites are allocated for development in the Local Plan or not and it is important to consider whether any circumstances outweigh this conflict. While the NPPF advocates a plan-led approach, it is important to consider whether any circumstances outweigh the conflict. Development should be plan led unless material considerations indicate otherwise.

In line with Paragraph 8 of the National Planning Policy Framework (2019), achieving sustainable development means meeting an economic objective, a social objective and an environmental objective.

Emerging Policy SPL1 of the Publication Draft of the Local Plan 2017 includes a 'settlement hierarchy' aimed at categorising the district's towns and villages and providing a framework for directing development toward the most sustainable locations therefore being in line with the aims of the aforementioned paragraph 8 of the NPPF. This is the emerging policy equivalent to Saved Policy QL1 of the adopted Tendring District Local Plan 2007 which states that development should be focussed towards the larger urban areas and to within development boundaries as defined within the Local Plan.

Lawford is identified as a 'Town' within saved Policy QL1 of the adopted Tendring District Local Plan 2007 and is defined as a 'Small Urban Settlement' within Policy SPL1 of the emerging Tendring District Local Plan 2013-2033 and Beyond Publication Draft (June 2017) in recognition of its size and range of local services. For these settlements, the emerging Local Plan identifies opportunities to deliver sustainable housing growth on a large scale. To allow for this to happen, Settlement Development Boundaries have been drawn flexibly, where practical, to accommodate a range of sites both within and on the edge of Lawford and thus enabling them to be considered for residential development. With this in mind, the emerging Tendring District Local Plan 2013-2033 and Beyond Publication Draft (June 2017) settlement development boundary for Lawford, Manningtree and Mistley has been extended but does not include the application site.

The application site lies beyond the defined settlement limits with no footpaths or street lighting along the rural lane which is narrow and winding. There are no nearby bus stops

or amenities to support development in this locality meaning that future occupants would be car dependant for their day to day needs. The location of the application site fails to meet the social objective and there are no benefits that outweigh this conflict. In addition, approving development is this location would set a harmful precedent for further socially unsustainable residential development.

The siting of the mobile home near the northern boundary of 83 Hungerdown Lane where it can be viewed from the shared driveway, with its blue colouring means it is conspicuous in the rural lane setting. The mobile home is visible through the unruly and broken hedgerow from Hungerdown Lane and Tile Barn Lane. The siting of the mobile home in a position close to Hungerdown Lane, in a rural location causes harm to visual amenity and to the character of the immediate area consequently the proposal would be environmentally unsustainable.

2 Following Natural England's recent advice and the introduction of Zones of Influences around all European Designated Sites (i.e. Ramsar, Special Protection Areas and Special Area of Conservation). Within Zones of Influences (which the site falls within) Natural England are requesting financial contributions to mitigate against any recreational impact from new dwellings.

Under the Habitats Regulations, a development which is likely to have a significant effect or an adverse effect (alone or in combination) on a European designated site must provide mitigation or otherwise must satisfy the tests of demonstrating 'no alternatives' and 'reasons of overriding public interest'. There is no precedent for a residential development meeting those tests, which means that all residential development must provide mitigation.

The application scheme constitutes a new dwelling on a site that lies within the Zone of Influence (ZoI) being approximately 3394 metres away from Stour and Orwell Estuaries RAMSAR Site and SPA.

New housing development within the ZoI would be likely to increase the number of recreational visitors to Stour and Orwell Estuaries and in combination with other developments it is likely that the proposal would have significant effects on the designated site. Mitigation measures must therefore be secured prior to occupation.

A proportionate financial contribution has not been secured in accordance with the emerging Essex Coast Recreational disturbance Avoidance and Mitigation Strategy (RAMS) requirements. As submitted, there is no certainty that the development would not adversely affect the integrity of Habitats sites.

The proposal is therefore considered to be contrary to Policies EN6 and EN11a of the Saved Tendring District Local Plan 2007, Policy PPL4 of the emerging Tendring District Local Plan 2013-2033 and Beyond Publication Draft and Regulation 63 of the Conservation of Habitat and Species Regulations 2017.

**DATED:** 23rd April 2020

SIGNED:

Graham Nourse Acting Assistant Director Planning Service

#### **IMPORTANT INFORMATION :-**

The local planning authority considers that the following policies and proposals in the development plan are relevant to the above decision:

NPPF National Planning Policy Framework February 2019

National Planning Practice Guidance

Tendring District Local Plan 2007

- QL1 Spatial Strategy
- QL9 Design of New Development
- QL10 Designing New Development to Meet Functional Needs
- QL11 Environmental Impacts and Compatibility of Uses
- HG1 Housing Provision
- HG6 Dwelling Size and Type
- HG7 Residential Densities
- HG9 Private Amenity Space
- COM6 Provision of Recreational Open Space for New Residential Development
- EN1 Landscape Character
- EN6 Biodiversity
- EN11A Protection of International Sites European Sites and RAMSAR Sites
- TR1A Development Affecting Highways
- TR7 Vehicle Parking at New Development

Tendring District Local Plan 2013-2033 and Beyond Publication Draft (June 2017)

- SP1 Presumption in Favour of Sustainable Development
- SPL1 Managing Growth
- SPL3 Sustainable Design
- HP5 Open Space, Sports & Recreation Facilities
- LP1 Housing Supply
- LP2 Housing Choice
- LP3 Housing Density and Standards

- LP4 Housing Layout
- PPL3 The Rural Landscape
- PPL4 Biodiversity and Geodiversity
- CP1 Sustainable Transport and Accessibility

Positive and Proactive Statement

The Local Planning Authority has acted positively and proactively in determining this application by identifying matters of concern with the proposal and determining the application within a timely manner, clearly setting out the reason(s) for refusal, allowing the Applicant the opportunity to consider the harm caused and whether or not it can be remedied by a revision to the proposal. The Local Planning Authority is willing to meet with the Applicant to discuss the best course of action and is also willing to provide pre-application advice in respect of any future application for a revised development.

#### The attached notes explain the rights of appeal.

## NOTES FOR GUIDANCE

#### WHEN PLANNING PERMISSION IS REFUSED OR GRANTED SUBJECT TO CONDITIONS

#### APPEALS TO THE SECRETARY OF STATE

- If you are aggrieved by the decision of your local planning authority to refuse permission for the proposed development or to grant it subject to conditions, then you can appeal to the Secretary of State under Section 78 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990.
- If you want to appeal, then you must do so within the set time frame as outlined below:
  - a. If this is a decision to refuse planning permission for a householder application, if you want to appeal against your local planning authority's decision then you must do so within **12 weeks** of the date of this notice. A **Householder Appeal Form** is required, available online at <a href="https://www.gov.uk/planning-inspectorate">https://www.gov.uk/planning-inspectorate</a>
  - b. If this is a decision to refuse planning permission for a minor commercial application, if you want to appeal against your local planning authority's decision then you must do so within **12 weeks** of the date of this notice. A **Planning Appeal Form** is required, available online at <u>https://www.gov.uk/planning-inspectorate</u>
  - c. If you want to appeal against your local planning authority's decision on a development which is not caught by a. and b. above then you must do so within 6 months of the date of this notice. A Planning Appeal Form is required, available online at <u>https://www.gov.uk/planning-inspectorate</u>
- Appeals must be made using the relevant form (as detailed above) which you can get from the Secretary of State at Temple Quay House, 2 The Square, Temple Quay, Bristol, BS1 6PN (Tel: 0303 444 5000) or online at <a href="https://www.gov.uk/planning-inspectorate">https://www.gov.uk/planning-inspectorate</a>. Please note, only the applicant possesses the right of appeal.
- The Secretary of State can allow a longer period for giving notice of an appeal, but will not normally be prepared to use this power unless there are special circumstances which excuse the delay in giving notice of appeal.
- The Secretary of State need not consider an appeal if it seems to the Secretary of State that the local planning authority could not have granted permission for the proposed development or could not have granted it without the conditions imposed having regard to the statutory requirements, to the provisions of any development order and to any directions given under a development order.
- If you intend to submit an appeal that you would like examined by inquiry then you must notify the Local Planning Authority and Planning Inspectorate (inquiryappeals@planninginspectorate.gov.uk) at least 10 days before submitting the appeal. <u>Further details are on GOV.UK.</u>

#### ENFORCEMENT

If this is a decision on a planning application relating to the same or substantially the same land and development as is already the subject of an enforcement notice, if you want to appeal against your local planning authority's decision on your application, then you must do so within 28 days of the date of this notice. If an enforcement notice is served relating to the same or substantially the same land and development as in your application and if you want to appeal against your local planning authority's decision on your application, then you must do so within 28 days of the date of service of the enforcement notice, or within 6 months (12 weeks in the case of a householder or minor commercial appeal) of the date of this notice, whichever period expires earlier.